






NAME OF THE TOOL

Contrasting Ethical Dilemmas Exercise

DESCRIPTION OF THE TOOL

In today's fast changing world, there is a lot of pressure on being politically correct. The ease at which bad news can be magnified through social media and interpreted the wrong way also exacerbates the problem. This exercise presents a series of ethical dilemmas through which you can address a variety of subjects. The discussions are key in this exercise which should be controlled based on what you want to teach the participants. For example, if you are using this exercise in a course on management skills, you should relate this to the kind of decisions a manager needs to make and the resources available to him or her. The exercise also includes a framework for ethical decision making (Annex 1). The framework for ethical decision making is a useful method for exploring ethical dilemmas and identifying ethical courses of action.

OBJECTIVES OF THE TOOL

-  to facilitate discussion of ethical dilemmas.
-  to study and practice the art of ethical decision making.
-  To discuss scenario and decide the best course of action.

CONNECTION THE TOOL WITH THE SKILL

Please explain the connection of this tool with the skill and how this tool help to develop the skills.

Making good ethical decisions requires a trained sensitivity to ethical issues and a practiced method for exploring the ethical aspects of a decision and weighing the considerations that should impact our choice of

TRAINING TOOL

“ DECISION MAKING



a course of action. Having a method for ethical decision making is absolutely essential. When practiced regularly, the method becomes so familiar that we work through it automatically without consulting the specific steps.

The more novel and difficult the ethical choice we face, the more we need to rely on discussion and dialogue with others about the dilemma. Only by careful exploration of the problem, aided by the insights and different perspectives of others, can we make good ethical choices in such situations.



RESOURCES AND MATERIALS



For implementation use the following scenarios:

Scenario 1:

You are a manager and have received two CVs. One CV is from an individual with a university degree and 20 years of experience in the industry. The person is relatively successful and wants to work for a new company.

The second CV is from a recent graduate with no experience but has studied in the same university and field as you did. This person's studies are directly in line with the work that your organisation does, and as chance has it, this candidate is also a keen windsurfer, just as you are.

In your view, they both seem to be good candidates, but you can only hire one. The recent graduate is fresh blood for the organisation and is malleable but requires significant training and familiarisation with the industry.

The other candidate is older with real-world experience. Has contacts in the industry which can be useful for your business. You can delegate your ever-increasing workload and use your time to do more important tasks.

TRAINING TOOL

“ DECISION MAKING



Would you hire the young guy because of a common hobby and a common university? Or would you get the experienced guy?

TRAINING TOOL

“ DECISION MAKING



Scenario 2:

You are a line manager in a medium size tech company. You are about to close a deal with an important client. However, the signing of the contract is delayed because you need certain data which is on another manager's computer. She is currently away on holiday, and you cannot wait until she is back. You work closely together, and you know what her login password is. You decide to go to her office and use the password to gain access to her computer, get the data you need and proceed to close the deal. This deal is important and can help with your potential promotion. When you login to her computer, you get a few notifications on new email messages. You recognise one where she is communicating with a high-up manager of a rival competitor, sharing sensitive data. You don't want to rummage for too long, you get your data and logout of the computer, feeling guilty that you have breached a level of trust. The data you were after will help you win your contract. Though you wonder what to do with the information you just gained. Should you confront her when she is back? Should you let HR know, leading to possible disciplinary action? If so, you will have to declare how you came about the information, which can in turn get you in trouble. What would you do?

Scenario 3:

Your company produces a widget. The manufacturing cost of this widget has dropped by 50%. One of your customers is a friend of one the top managers in the company and has found out about this. He wants to place an order and expects to get a discount. You as a manager, approve this discount and the sale goes ahead. Shortly after, another client places the same exact order for the widget. This client is a long-term customer and one of your best friends but doesn't know anything about the drop in manufacturing costs. Would you tell her about the reduction in manufacturing costs and offer her a similar discount or would you withhold the information and let her pay the full price?

TRAINING TOOL

“ DECISION MAKING



IMPLEMENTATION OF THE TOOL



Explain the steps to implement the tool.



What You Need

- A series of scenarios. You need one scenario for each group of three delegates. These scenarios are provided below. Consider adding your own.



Setup

- Explain the purpose of the exercise so delegates know what is expected of them *before* you distribute the scenarios.
- Divide the delegates to groups of three.
- Distribute a scenario to each group.
- Ask each group to review their scenario and evaluate each choice. They should then come up with the pros and cons of each option. Finally, they must recommend a course of action and be able to justify it.
- Allocate 15 minutes for this part.
- Bring back everyone together and ask each group to present their findings.
- Encourage other groups to challenge the suggestions and moderate a controlled discussion.
- Highlight key learning points.



Timing

Explaining the Exercise: 2 minutes

Activity: 15 min scenario analysis + 20 min group discussions = 35 minutes

Group Feedback: 10 minutes



Discussion

Was it easy to come up with a decision in your group? What did others think when you presented your answer? Did you change your mind? What did

TRAINING TOOL

“ DECISION MAKING





you think of other groups' scenarios and decisions? Was there a common theme for the dilemmas experienced across all scenarios?

WHAT YOU LEARN

This exercise facilitates discussion of ethical dilemmas. In most job, some decisions are not straight forward to make because one clear choice comes with certain ethical issues. The question then becomes more of what is right or wrong to do, what is conscientious, and sometimes even what is legal. The aim is to become aware of such situations, to discuss dilemmas and through justification of decisions made illuminate and strengthen one's ethical point of view in decision making process.

REFERENCE

 <https://www.skillsconverged.com/FreeTrainingMaterials/tabid/258/articleType/ArticleView/articleId/1188/categoryId/114/Contrasting-Ethical-Dilemmas-Exercise.aspx>

 <https://www.scu.edu/ethics/ethics-resources/ethical-decision-making/a-framework-for-ethical-decision-making/>



Annex 1 - A Framework for Ethical Decision Making

Recognize an Ethical Issue

1. Could this decision or situation be damaging to someone or to some group? Does this decision involve a choice between a good and bad alternative, or perhaps between two "goods" or between two "bads"?
2. Is this issue about more than what is legal or what is most efficient? If so, how?

Get the Facts

3. What are the relevant facts of the case? What facts are not known? Can I learn more about the situation? Do I know enough to make a decision?
4. What individuals and groups have an important stake in the outcome? Are some concerns more important? Why?
5. What are the options for acting? Have all the relevant persons and groups been consulted? Have I identified creative options?

Evaluate Alternative Actions

6. Evaluate the options by asking the following questions:
 - Which option will produce the best and do the least harm? (The Utilitarian Approach)
 - Which option best respects the rights of all who have a stake? (The Rights Approach)
 - Which option treats people equally or proportionately? (The Justice Approach)
 - Which option best serves the community, not just some members? (The Common Good Approach)
 - Which option leads me to act as the sort of person I want to be? (The Virtue Approach)

TRAINING TOOL

“ DECISION MAKING



Make a Decision and Test It

7. Considering all these approaches, which option best addresses the situation?
8. If I told someone I respect -- or told a television audience -- which option I have chosen, what would they say?

Act and Reflect on the Outcome

9. How can my decision be implemented with the greatest care and attention to the concerns of all stakeholders?
10. How did my decision turn out and what have I learned from this specific situation?